

**Oversight Committee – 20 November 2014****Transcript of Item 8: The Mayor's Annual Equalities Report 2013-14**

**Caroline Pidgeon AM MBE:** There has obviously been some progress in terms of equalities, in terms of the transport service, and maybe for Peter, how does TfL make choices about how it prioritises which stations to make step-free and how are you going to decide from this new £75 million fund which locations should benefit?

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** There are various strands to it. Clearly, I think we have done everything that is easy. That is the first thing to say. The reason, on the national railway network, you can get so much more for your money is because many of them are at ground level or above, therefore putting in ramps and that sort of thing is relatively easy to do.

On the Tube, you know that much of it is very old, you know that giving step-free access at deep-level Tube stations is complex and difficult, notwithstanding the fact that many of them have lift shafts, only they do not go to platform level. The most recent course of action that we have taken is to prioritise those places, which will deliver the most good, in terms of passenger numbers, and that is the right thing to do. The Olympic access was done, Green Park was significant, a junction of three lines. As rebuilt stations, you have already heard me talk once about rebuilt stations today, places like Tottenham Court Road, all the Crossrail stations, Bond Street, Victoria, as those schemes come forward, although there is a lot of money associated, if you look at the plans for Bank you will see, like King's Cross, you have to put in a lot of different lifts to make it accessible. The benefits that result to people with movement difficulties are far more substantial than it would be if you just looked at geographical maps, bearing in mind the bus service is totally accessible.

In respect to the additional money that has been put forward to match-fund things, clearly part of the conditionality there is that there is some match-funding. One of your colleagues, who is not here today, has been assiduous in promoting the cause of Harrow on the Hill, which indeed does have a great deal of footfall. I was up at Harrow a couple of weeks ago, three weeks ago now, and we had a very encouraging conversation where, if the council bring some of their own money to the party, we will bring some of that £75 million, and there is some development both on our land and other people's land. I think we might crack that place. That place is of course extremely difficult because it has three island platforms, two entrances either side, so you need five lifts to make it accessible.

We will then look at a variety of other places. I mean, as you know, a separate strand of activity is what Graeme Craig [Commercial Development Director, Transport for London] is doing, which is looking at commercial opportunities, and one of the reasons that £75 million is there, because clearly if we can get commercial development on and around our station sites, on our land, then we certainly ought to include in that, if we can, accessibility. Therefore, I think the £75 million will go towards, hopefully, places with the maximum footfall, and places with development potential and particularly places where third parties can bring some money to the picture. That will include local authorities, some of whom have pressed very hard.

Then the last part of that is, you will have seen yesterday or today, the Department have now announced finally that the last three Crossrail stations outside London will be funded and that is a really good thing as well.

**Caroline Pidgeon AM MBE:** In terms of meeting the needs of disabled Londoners, how would you take into account their needs when you look at changes to other transport infrastructure, such as pedestrian waiting

times and our recent work on the Transport Committee found that you had reduced the green-man crossing time at 568 crossings across London since 2010, yet many disabled and older people walk at a slower speed than that you assume. Also obviously other changes you are planning, such as the cycle superhighways.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** In terms of the green time for pedestrians, I think an answer is on its way about that. I think we have to comply, as you know, with DfT guidelines as to how crossings work. Pedestrian countdown is a benefit enabling people to make their own assessment about whether it is safe to cross in time. I think there is a more detailed answer on its way to that.

In terms of the cycle superhighways, part of the consultation is about pedestrian crossings, and there you have some of the conundrum in a nutshell because the result of the proposals that we recently put out for consultation, which have just closed, is to improve pedestrian access, however I know, because there is no shortage of people telling you what they commented, that there are some still further proposals for more pedestrian crossings as a consequence. There has to be some balance in that, simply because our responsibility as a highway authority, and our wider responsibility to London, is to make the road network accessible for everybody, including all forms of vehicle users. Therefore it is a balance, and it is a debatable balance, and you will know through the Transport Committee that we have some pretty vigorous discussions about that balance.

**Caroline Pidgeon AM MBE:** OK, and finally from me, obviously there has been a lot in the news the last couple of weeks around Court of Appeal hearings around the issue of the priority between disabled bus users and other members of the public, and that tension, the buggy versus wheelchair tension that many of us have experienced. What is your view on that and where does the balance lie?

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** We will see what the Court of Appeal makes of it. You could design a bus with a very large open space that would accommodate both. If you do, you will rule out from travelling a very large number of people who have other difficulties in movement who need to sit down. Sadly, in my increasing years, I am now one of them, and the ability to stand for long periods of time is no longer something that, in some medical conditions, I can stand myself. Therefore I understand that on a personal basis. Equally, I have a personal view, which is that I would be really interested to see how the Court of Appeal deal with this, because it is a really difficult issue. If you are in a wheelchair, and we offer a wheelchair accessible bus service, you have a right to seat in a bus that comes, unless the space is full with another wheelchair user we will take you on.

What you would like to think is that the population of relatively young people with children would seek to accommodate, as a matter of commonsense, a wheelchair user who would like to use that space. Sadly what we are finding increasingly is that parents are unwilling, or apparently unable, to take their child out of a buggy, which in some cases is now designed not to be folded up, and the consequence of that is that you do get buggy rage and the driver is no more able to solve that, whether inside or outside the cab, and I would rather he or she stayed inside because that is when assaults occur. I am of the view, we will see what the Court of Appeal says, because I think they have been posed with a very difficult challenge; however I am of the view that quite a lot of this could be solved if people were practical and sensible and not always in a very practical and sensible side.

**Caroline Pidgeon AM MBE:** I am sure we recommended in a previous report from the Transport Committee that you should almost give approval to bus-friendly buggies that were smaller and could fold up and so on, however I am not sure you took us up on that, however certainly it was a discussion we had and I think that might help with some of the tension, because a lot of buggies do not fold up and then you have conflict.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** I think the difficulty with that, it now seems to me, as a parent of children who might one day produce offspring themselves, that increasingly a

buggy is not only a means of transport for the child, but a fashion item, which has some design characteristics that are not designed to be small, mobile or easily stowed. That is why, in my own mind, the presumption is rather more towards people with disabilities, because if you are in a wheelchair you are only there because you cannot get around without one and that is a big difference. We can write a reasonable set of rules and we can expect people to do reasonable things, beyond which you have to expect the citizens of a wonderful world city to be sufficiently bright sometimes to take other people into account. That is the real issue because, if somebody does not have the gumption to fold up their buggy and sit somewhere with their child because there is somebody in a wheelchair who must obviously be travelling in a wheelchair, then I am not sure our drivers, or our contractors' drivers, or anybody else, or me, can make them think any differently.

**Caroline Pidgeon AM MBE:** Thank you.

**Joanne McCartney AM:** I want to pull up Peter with something I asked both you and the Mayor about in a plenary session a couple of months ago, and that was about the safety particularly of women feeling less safe on the transport network. You said at the time, because I asked you to do a proactive campaign like they do in New York, and you said you were in the process of planning something. Can you just briefly outline what you are doing?

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** I believe we are going to do one --

**Joanne McCartney AM:** Because the Mayor yesterday did not know.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** No, I think there is a limit to the level of detail, and I know that we are going to do something because I have read it somewhere; however, sadly, I read three bags of work on Monday during the last day of my holiday and I know that was in it, however that is all I can remember.

**Joanne McCartney AM:** The Mayor was able to tell me that there has been an increase in covert operations and there was 150,000 leaflets being printed, however New York are now on their second phase of their safety and they deal with station announcement over platforms, all their staff are trained to take reports, and they have an online reporting tool where passengers who witness something can upload photos, which go directly to the police. I was going to ask you, when you are looking at this, would you look at all that good practice as well?

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** I can tell you one thing that has happened, which is that the British Transport Police (BTP), who, as you know, are responsible for policing the Underground --

**Joanne McCartney AM:** We know about Project Guardian.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** No, I am going to tell you something different, which is that BTP, who police the Underground and all the British rail network in total, have just started a text number where you can text details of something that has happened to you, which is unpleasant, or you feel that it threatens you, and that is a virtually real-time means of getting them to take it up. I have asked them, because I only just discovered that myself, how that is going to be publicised, because it is no point having that facility unless you are able. The fact that I know it is one thing; the fact that anybody who might otherwise feel that they needed it is another. We will have to take that onboard and I will write to the Assembly and let you have some more details.

**Joanne McCartney AM:** Just look at what the New York Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) are doing because they look to be doing something really proactive.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** Yes, but of course they do not have anybody on their station platforms at all, which is why they have to rely on the passengers to report it all.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Chair, can I follow on from that, because this is not new, Peter, we go back to 2012 about this whole area, and we have made some strides, and I think there are some excellent examples of where TfL has come up with some good work, therefore it is just really confirming from you for the record that the questionnaire about satisfaction with the service has retained that question about harassment, as we argued long and hard to win that, and if you cannot answer me now, I think I would like that back.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** I believe it has, however I am certainly happy to answer that.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Because it was -- us winning that argument that then got the data, which absolutely you have to have the data, that then brought the thing above the radar. Therefore I would welcome that continuation. I am totally, as I said, from 2012, when I looked at the New York model, yes, great, however I think we do not necessarily have to go to New York as well.

I would like you to ask your staff to look at greater collaboration with boroughs. For instance, Brixton Station in Lambeth, when Lambeth had a lead member and commitment from the council to do something about women's safety around the forecourt of Brixton Station, they could not get the co-operation of TfL's staff to do it there, a little bit of joint working. I think, if you were to explore that and look at other boroughs that are doing similar, then we would be able to go further in this road. It is those sort of things, the small things, that we can do here in collaboration with other initiatives that I do not think is being picked up and that is what I wanted to draw your attention to.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** I am sorry; that is not the right response from us if it is correct.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Yes, it is correct, and I would agree with you, it is not, and I just want it explored to see if there are other missed opportunities.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** Who has some details on that?

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** I can get you the details, of course.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** We are going to meet shortly, therefore maybe.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Yes, and I think similarly you talked about BTP and they are at this stage, because they have the staff to do it, and of course they take the national role on it, and again I just wondered if you could confirm sort of like where we have had these major transport interchanges that there is some thinking about collaborative work there and exchange. It seems to me silly, if you are going to get BTP really up on their game, and then you move from BTP and then you go on the Underground and that sort of safety is not the same.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** BTP cover both, however the question, which again I will answer in correspondence, is to make sure that the Metropolitan Police Service, who police

the surface outside the stations, are equally involved. Now I believe that they are because the way that all that tasking is done, it is done through a process where the Metropolitan Police Service and the BTP are in the same place, however we will write and confirm that. I am very happy to do that.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Yes, I mean I think we have a way to go, because there was some work recently comparing cities of the world, and we were not world leaders when they did the analysis. Again, I can let you have that work.

Then lastly, about another issue about the transport. I love the signs that there are now asking people, buggy users, to be mindful of the fact that wheelchair users need that space as well. Again, well done to your staff and again it is an argument that had to be won with you guys and an assurance that you will keep up that level of awareness. Because I agree with you, given the work that has been done for staff awareness and getting staff to get involved in that difficult area between a mother/buggy/baby and a disabled user, I think what we want to hear from you is an assurance that you are going to ensure that what has been done so far will continue.

**Darren Johnson:** Those buses that have a bend in them, long ones, you know, plenty of room.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Lastly, Peter, do you have anything to tell us, if not today, later on, about accessibility in terms of the new bus when most of them will be running shortly, as I understand it, without the attendant? I mean the attendant, most of them are a waste of space in my experience, however they are there, as I understand, they were there to ensure health and safety and it is not about wheelchair users, it is about I suppose people like me and you and older who are happy to get that assistance.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** You are not as old as I am.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** It is my understanding that the new bus is not going to have that attendant and it will then be down to these new buses going and the back door will be closed. I mean have you tested this? The question is, will you go back to disabled users of London and their organisations to talk through with them any proposed changes that will be coming along with regard to the Boris bus, I am talking about.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** I think we are quite clear about it, which is that vehicle is suitable for -- I mean all vehicles other than the old buses on route 15, are capable, as they should be, and are required by law to be, accessible for people with disabilities and wheelchairs. Therefore the operation of the new bus, where it does not have a second person on it, and many of them do not, either by time or by route, is the same as any other doored bus, and the wheelchair facility is the same, and no disabled users group needs any instruction about that because it is all as it would normally be.

Where the back is open, there is an attendant, then that attendant is obviously available to help people, and I have seen them do it. However it is an extra, the fact that the attendant might not be there on some buses or at some times or on some routes does not worsen the position of people with disabilities in relation to wheelchair access to buses because that all works as normal. Where they are there, they are very good people, and they quite frequently help, as they should.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** OK, thanks.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** OK, anymore questions on transport? OK, then I want to just raise a quick point, in fact Green Party Group colleagues have raised questions in the past, on reduced numbers of people killed and injured on London's roads. OK, we start with 500 junctions, we are now focusing on 33, I think the latest position from TfL via the Mayor is in the coming months you are going to come back with some outcome

actions or whatever. Is it a capacity issue of why it just seems to be very slow, even on 33? I understand the nature of highways and planning and consultation and all the rest of it. What is it that seems to be dragging its heels in this process?

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** I think the frank answer to that is...

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** Sorry, and I presume these 33 are the ones that are on some priority, the most dangerous or with people at risk of being injured or killed.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** There is a whole raft of issues in there. One of them is that is not by any means the only road safety measure that you would take, quite obviously not, and there is a whole range of other activities, which are designed to make things safer, including a lot of work to do with heavy goods vehicles, for example, which are disproportionately responsible for death and serious injury for cyclists, and all that sort of stuff.

Therefore I think then that the first thing I would say is that those are important things to do, however that is not the only issue in road safety. The priority attached to those junctions is such that many of the ones that you would most want to deal with are the most complicated ones to do, and there is no doubt that both the process of designing them has taken us longer than anybody thought, because it has proved really difficult to do, and there has been a policy change in the sense that traditional highway engineering treats, for example, cyclists as part of the normal traffic flow, and if you do that it is easier to redesign a junction for pedestrian safety than if you treat cyclists separately. We are struggling, and I mean struggling, to find the space in many of those cases to do what a significant and vocal set of road users want, which is to segregate cyclists safely.

In some cases we have been through multiple design processes, none of them have been satisfactory, we have been out to consultation, we have had yet further ideas, and that is associated with then other characteristics of those junctions, which is some of them are saturated with traffic. If you look at King's Cross as a case, we have had at least one fatality there very sadly. King's Cross is a really difficult junction to make work. I think it is right, as I have said before in the Transport Committee, that we should not be proud of the fact that we have not spent the money as fast as we should have done, however we ought to be proud that we are trying really, really hard to design solutions that in many cases nobody else has managed.

If you look at some of the things, our attention is always drawn to what goes on in Holland, what goes on in the US, what goes on in France, and they have the luxury of space on their urban roads that we simply do not have. Therefore trying to find a solution, which allows traffic to flow, including buses, because that is important; tries to protect cyclists, preferably by segregation because that is a policy in the Mayor's Cycling Vision; protecting pedestrians with adequate crossing time, is really fundamentally very difficult. I mean I am willing to offer, because I think it would be instructive, any Members of the Assembly who want to come and talk to the people who Leon [Daniels, Managing Director, Surface Transport] employs to do this, and you will find no lack of enthusiasm or drive to achieve this. Some of the answers are just really difficult to do and I think that we are caught between a fervent desire to do something good with the reality that sometimes we have done something good, however it has not proved to be enough. If you recall the case of Bow Roundabout, it has taken us a long time to get that right, we now have a solution that required a change in the regulations. It is still not good enough for pedestrians after all this time. I do not know that we ever know that it will be to the satisfaction of some of the pedestrians, however we will try.

What I would say, and I hope you can see there is some passion here, because I have been more involved in some of this than maybe you might expect, however if you would like to speak to some of the people who are doing this for an hour or two you would begin to see some of the difficulties and why it has taken the time. It is not slow and it is only resource to the extent to which you are looking in a market of people in highway

engineering, many of whom have never even confronted these issues before. There is no history in it. If you think the rest of Britain is looking towards the amount of money spent in London, not budgeted, but actually spent, and say, "This is tremendous", in reality what you realise is that there is no market of highway engineers in the rest of Britain who know how to do this, and when you talk to people in Copenhagen, as Leon and I have done, and say, "We are trying to do what you do there on our road network", they say, "Wow". Take me up, if you will, because I would love you to talk to some of the people trying to do this to see -- you give your own test about their passionate commitment to doing it and how hard they are working.

However some of the solutions just are not easy to do and we will have the same problem with the famous East-West Cycle Superhighway where there are some really difficult balances to be struck between traffic movement between cycling facilities, which people will acknowledge as world class, and sufficient pedestrian space. You only have to look at the capacity of the pavements when those poppies were in the moat at Tower Hill to realise that one of the options is not to take away the pavement space. That is what I would say to that and I hope some of you will take us up with that because that would be a visit well worth -- you will have to come, for those to do it, and you will meet some junior and middle-ranking highway engineers and technicians, and please talk to them about it. I would love you to do it.

**John Biggs AM:** I know they talk about the Bow Roundabout and I agree with everything you have said, however something that is interesting in the context of this item, which is around the equalities community, is that fundamentally it is also about changing the culture of the organisation. I think 20 years ago people would not have spoken about pedestrian and cycle priority in quite the same way as they do now and I think now that is seen as about people's rights as against the historic sort of culture, which was about keeping the traffic moving. Therefore it is a cultural change.

**Sir Peter Hendy CBE (Commissioner, Transport for London):** John, that is absolutely right, and I hope you can tell that I am at least trying to be honest about it, I think the highway and traffic engineering fraternity have been a long way back. I pride myself in coming from the bus-operating industry where we embraced disability access against the manufacturers who were initially very reluctant. I remember when it was not possible to design a wheelchair accessible double deck bus and I was assured absolutely categorically that you could not do it, and now we have an entire fleet of them. The highway engineering people have come from a long way back, you will find the history of it is all about traffic circulation and not about pedestrians, cyclists and even bus users, and it has taken us a long way. Part of our problem, I think, is that we are inventing solutions, which the rest of the country is looking at and saying, "Gosh, we have never done anything like this", and we are going abroad and talking to them and what we are finding is they do have better solutions, however they have a lot more space to do them in.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** Thank you. All right, let us move on.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Thank you. I think this is to Munira Mirza. From the Mayor's Equality Report, it indicates that there is a decrease in the pay gap between different groups of Londoners, and that is welcome, however there remains a stubbornly high ethnic pay gap. Why do you think this is and, I suppose I might say, what are we going to do to resolve it?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** In terms of thinking about the reasons why that is, and obviously it is very complicated, there are historic reasons why certain groups have tended to be in low-pay sectors. There is a degree to which we can, as regional government, intervene using programmes like the European Social Funds, and we have a number of different programmes that are about trying to train up people, particularly young people, to access higher-level skilled jobs, which obviously pay more. I think one of the main things that the Mayor can do is to promote the London living wage, and we have seen quite considerable success there. I believe the numbers in the last year have increased quite rapidly. I refer my notes

and that has doubled, in terms of the numbers of companies that have adopted that. Obviously there was a recent announcement about increasing the rate of the London living wage, which I think should go some way to addressing the problem.

**Andrew Boff AM:** That kind of addresses low-paid workers, however the ethnic gap is surely across the board, including middle and high-income earners as well, there is a considerable ethnic pay gap. I mean you can understand that there needs to be a time for adjustment, however what is being done to ensure that adjustment takes place? What is being done to provide those opportunities to people who it looks like may have been excluded from particular areas of the job market?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** There are some broad things that can be done to improve and narrow the gap. The area of education and skills development, which obviously through the Greater London Authority (GLA) we have developed an education programme, which is about training up people so that they are able to access those higher-paid skilled jobs. I do think that over time that will change and we will see that developing.

There is an argument that in some sectors the way in which recruitment operates means that certain groups tend to replicate themselves in senior jobs within a structure. You could call that discrimination of sorts; it is also just the way in which certain private sector operates. They do not have to go through the same sort of transparent recruitment process that the public sector has to. There are some interventions, for instance working with companies on how they recruit, trying to encourage them to widen the pool of applicants that they bring in. Those are things that we can do through our funding. The apprenticeships programme is another really important way of trying to encourage people into sectors, which are again highly paid. However I do not think there is a sort of silver bullet for trying to narrow that gap very quickly, it is about those longer-term interventions.

**Andrew Boff AM:** I mean it is something that is much on our mind on the Assembly. We are looking at challenges in among our own staff and the frustration of seeing shortlists of people that are not representative of the city that we seek to represent, it is very frustrating, and I just wondered what the key message is in changing that. You are saying there is no silver bullet, however is there something that employers should be at least trying to do?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I know the Metropolitan Police Service (MPS), for instance, has introduced a new rule, which is that you cannot apply unless you have been resident in London for three out of the last six years. That has obviously had a huge impact on the recruitment of ethnic minorities. You could argue pros and cons, however that has been a measure. I think it is very difficult though to persuade any private sector operator that by restricting the pool of applicants that is something they would want to do.

My own view is that these interventions, which are about raising the skills levels, while encouraging employers to widen their recruitment and cast their net wider than currently, I think those are the ways to do it. I mean the London Legacy Development Corporation (LLDC), for instance, has quite proactive measures to encourage local recruitment and to try to train up and give skills development to the people that they employ, therefore rather than just taking on low-skilled low-paid workers and then leaving them in that position, what can you do to enhance their training while they are on the job.

We have done a programme, worked with, through our Migration Partnership Board, on how we can work with employers to add English language training to low-skilled workers, because we know that is one of the ways in which they can access higher-paid jobs. I think it is those kinds of measures, however they do take some time.



**Andrew Boff AM:** Thank you for that. One of the criteria that came up with a big red mark was the rise in the gap in the employment rate of young Londoners and those aged between 25 and 49. What are the Mayor and the London Enterprise Panel (LEP) doing to focus on that?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Can I just start by making one point, which is a piece of good news, which I think has gone relatively under-reported, which is that the NEET [Not in Education, Employment, or Training] rate in London has halved since 2006 to 3.8% and considering where things were in 2008 when I started the job that was seen as a serious problem and London had one of the worst problems in the country and it is the lowest rate.

**Andrew Boff AM:** We seemed to talk of little else on the Economic Development, Culture, Sport and Tourism Committee at the time but the NEET rate.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Exactly, therefore I think there has been some good news on that front.

You asked about employment of young people?

**Andrew Boff AM:** The red mark came up for the gap in the employment rate of young Londoners and those aged between 25 and 49, the disparity between those, and that rose from 29.2%, the gap, to 36.2%, between 2008 and 2014. Now, I do not know when those two 2014 figures are current to, because we are now hearing the youth unemployment is declining, however still that comes up as a red mark and we need to find out why really.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Sorry, just bear with me while I check.

**Andrew Boff AM:** In the Mayor's report, page 16.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I just want to explain something, and I questioned this as well. It is red, however I think it is slightly misleading because it includes those who are in education, it includes students, because technically, according to the criteria, students are counted as employable, and therefore that is one of the reasons why the rate --

**Andrew Boff AM:** Are they?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. I just wanted to get clarity on that. I did query whether it should be red, however technically, according to our data, it should be, however I think the news is much more positive. Therefore, let me just give you the statistic that clarifies that a bit more.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Yes.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** March 2014, the employment rate of young Londoners aged 18 to 24 was 43%, including students, or 67% not including students, this is 3.5% lower than the employment rate for London. Therefore it is still an issue, however it is not quite as stark as it seems.

**Andrew Boff AM:** All right, however in terms of the direction of travel, these are about measuring the direction of travel between 2008 and 2014. Are we saying the direction of travel, taking into account that student figure, is the right direction of travel?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is improving

**Andrew Boff AM:** It is improving, it is not a red really if we take out students?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I did query it, I think maybe we should look at the criteria and measurements, which were used, however because it is an important issue.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Fine, perhaps we will revisit that later about how we measure it, or how you measure it really, because we took that as being a negative and if it is not I have just wasted everyone's time.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** No, I think it is a fair point. There are a lot of good things I can say about the increase in apprenticeship starts, the fact that we want to do more to ensure younger people can access apprenticeships. That is an issue.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Yes, but we are the London Assembly, we do not concentrate on the good news. Finally from me, what are we doing with regard to helping women with dependent children back into work?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I think there are a number of things. The first is that we have been working with the Department for Education (DfE) on trying to increase childcare provision and improve equality and the range of childcare provision. We have been working with them on hosting events here at City Hall, for instance, with schools to try to encourage them to offer more nursery provision. By increasing the supply of provision, we think and believe that quality and the cost of childcare will be improved and make it much more feasible for women who wish to return to work to do so. Therefore that is one area.

The LEP are also committing some resource into I think trying to encourage better childcare provision and support people back into work, women back into work.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Is there that figure about women with dependent children going back into work, is London's figure so bad, as it is compared to the rest of the country, are there cultural or ethnic issues related to that figure?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes, I mean there are certain ethnic groups where the proportion of women who choose to return back to work after having children is just much, much higher, and they tend to have a large concentration in London, therefore I do not think it is just a generic issue for women who wish to return to work, there are certain ethnic communities and groups where that tends to be the case. Bangladeshi communities, for instance, large numbers of women choose to have children earlier and they tend to be full-time mums.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Can I just go back to apprenticeships, and page 18 of the report? The number of apprenticeships starts at page 18, it states, "The number of apprenticeships in London was 45,000-plus in 2012/2013." However, this is down from the previous year, 2011/2012, when the figure was 47,230. Now, the LEP has stated that an increase of 19% year on year was required in order to achieve the Mayor's target of 250,000 by 2016. Therefore we are not, are we, going to achieve the Mayor's target by 2016, are we, of apprenticeships?

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** There was some limited discussion about this, this morning, at the Budget and Performance Committee, which we have put in for traffic light purposes it is on amber, ie we know that there are serious challenges about meeting the target. These figures can be put in a slightly wider context. If I remember rightly, we are up to about

170,000 overall since 2010/2011 and in the current Mayoral period, ie from 2012/2013 onwards, I think we are at 95,000. That bears on the point that you are making about how many you need to get to hit the target and there is no question but that it is --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** It is not achievable.

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** Well it is a challenge. There is more money going in now to the LEP, through us, to try to keep up, we are trying to achieve the target, and that is what we are carrying on trying to do. We said this morning we would obviously need to have another look at it later next year.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Yes, because it is one of these things, is it not, and it is the overlap with Budget and Performance Committee, because it is quite likely, since the issue of the equalities disproportionality, everything sits with this Committee, but the sort of budgetary questioning sits with Budget, therefore I think we have to live with that overlap. However, what concerns me is I mean I think I heard Munira sort of saying in terms of her answer to Andrew Boff that you did not sound particularly concerned about apprenticeships. When asked, I thought your response was, "We are doing well with apprenticeships" but in terms of the target, you will not be doing well, will you?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Just let us put this into context. In the year 2012/13, there were 45,000 apprenticeship starts compared to 11,000 in 2005/06, so the rate has gone up considerably. The number of apprenticeships has --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Why are you using 2005/06 as their start date?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** That is the statistic I was given to have --

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** In the last two years, apprenticeship offers in every borough has gone down. The number of apprenticeships is going down in boroughs; they are not going up in the last two years. I will give you an example. We are talking about reductions of apprenticeships in boroughs to a degree of about 400; some are facing 600. If you combine the last two years together of apprenticeship offers, it is going down.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** The proportion of apprenticeships in London has gone up as part of the national share and I think there is a recognition that there needs to be a sustained marketing campaign to increase the number of apprenticeship opportunities but it is not the case that London is doing particularly worse than other regions. In fact, we are doing better; the rate of increase is faster in London than it is in other regions, so it is worth understanding that there has been a considerable increase as well.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** I absolutely take what you are saying and I think, from our side and from our day job constantly, we have this aspiration for London. We want it to be upfront; we want it to be the best that it can and what we use is a mayoral target or a mayoral commitment to judge it by, therefore, I just would like some recognition, as Jeff has said, coming from your department that much more needs to be done. We cannot do enough, if you like, because it is a pretty steep climb if we are to get anywhere near the 250,000, 100,000 target that was set. An admirable target but just a recognition that you cannot take it here, foot off the brake and your department, if your role is monitoring and challenge, then that has to be something that is on your on top ten list. That is really what I am trying to hear from you, if that is possible.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I think that everybody working on this recognises that it is a challenging target, as Jeff said, and a number of partnerships have been developed with

different industries of the catering and food sector, construction; these partnerships have been struck up because there is a recognition that we have to work with the industry as well in order to try to increase the number of apprenticeship opportunities. There is actual considerable demand; it is the supply of opportunities that is the issue.

There is a plan for a new marketing campaign funded by the LEP which has recently come through, so I think there are efforts and plans being put in place to try to meet that target. It is recognised that it is difficult.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Of course, within all of that, going back to the question, we are saying we have to be mindful of disproportionality and so any programmes, any marketing, whether targeted or not, can be looking at disproportionality in terms of maybe locality or particular communities. Are you mindful of that and will you be taking that onboard when you talk to the LEP about their spend?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. We do monitor actually the diversity of the apprenticeship start, so 40% are from ethnic minority backgrounds; half are women, 56%. I think it may have even been prompted by this Committee asking the question about the monitoring of this because we do keep an eye on it.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Particularly with the LEP and, of course, we talk about communities. We have this growing population of people with disabilities who are young and because of the science, want to get into apprenticeships as well as this growing body of young people who feel quite rightly that any offer available should be theirs as well. You are mindful of that population.

The Super-connected Cities programme; just a word about that. The Mayor launched it in March 2004 to be welcomed, loads of good work there and it is so necessary for the Capital's aspiration and, in fact, we are running to catch up in that area. What is the Mayor doing to ensure that Black and Minority Ethnic communities are aware and, therefore, if you like, working to ensure that they are not lagging behind? Have you looked and monitored that work? If you have not, then we could receive a report from you about that because I just think again in terms of our city and ensuring access, if we have programmes like this, then we should be doing, or certainly the Mayor's office, your team, should be doing all that we can to ensure that those communities are aware of these programmes and, through working with the boroughs, get involved as soon as possible.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** On the Super-connected City voucher scheme, there has been an extensive marketing campaign. It has been on TfL commentary, media coverage, leaflets, social media, working with business partners. We have had 1,716 businesses receive online vouchers either through the scheme that we promote or by a slightly different process. There has been taken up and is on-target to achieve the 4,000 businesses by March 2015.

We have not monitored the ethnic makeup of the businesses that sign up to it. We can look into whether that is possible or feasible. It is targeted at all the Small and Medium Enterprises (SME).

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** I think you will find, if you have an officer go back, that the Economic Scrutiny Committee, when this was being thought through, actually raised this point with members of your economic team who were leading on this in order for there to be some sort of data gatherer because then you come to the point today, and we are having this conversation, and then the answer from you to a question about any sort of profile you can give in up-take is there is no data. One sees an outstanding issue from another committee.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I will go back and I will check with that team whether there was a reason why they decided not to do the monitoring. It may have been fairly restrictive. Every time you monitor, it does add cost to a programme essentially. I suppose I would ask the question which is are you prompted to ask this because you are concerned that there is a lower, disproportionately low take-up from this group in which case we can look at that? From what I can see, the extensive marketing campaign is designed that it would reach small businesses, Small and Medium Enterprises regardless of their background in a sense. If there is a particular problem that you want to highlight, then I can also take that back to them.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Of course there is and I refer you back to the seminar that the Mayor put on last year, Black History Month, when he brought black leaders and members of those communities into this building and he, himself, recognised the disadvantage that they, as a group, face in terms of how they access information, particularly information from the public sector. On this particular scheme --

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Sorry, on this particular scheme or just in general?

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Can I just answer you? It is not a personal hobbyhorse of mine; it is based on speaking with business organisations and it is concerns that have been raised from this community and in this very building at a mayoral sponsored conference.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** OK. I think there is a possibility that businesses generally find it hard to get access to the same information from the public sector which is I think something that needs to be addressed. We can look certainly at monitoring and see if there is disproportionately low take-up of those groups and I can go back to that team and ask them. I think the kind of advertising, the kind of marketing strategy that that particular programme is using seems to me one that could reach potentially people of lots of different backgrounds, but I can look into it; we may have missed a trick.

In terms of other support for businesses which are led by Black and Minority Ethnic (BAME) groups, there are other schemes, there are other programmes that are supported by the LEP, by the Lloyds Development Capital (LDC). They are all detailed in the report. I am happy to talk about those but there are quite a lot of programmes which are also trying to support businesses.

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** We might follow-up in writing.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Follow-up in writing. As Andrew Boff [AM] said, it is the difficult issues that we have to tackle here and there are just some areas like data gathering that the mountain gets higher rather than declined.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** I just wanted to come in on this Super-connected Cities programme and actually come in on it from a completely different angle. It seems to me that it is a complete waste of money, what you have done. You have been struggling to get people to take up this programme and if you are serious about tackling inequality, off the GLA's own system, there is a map that shows - they are actually white spots rather than calling them black spots - where people have really, really poor broadband in London. They do not have equal access to broadband and, therefore, are struggling in terms of the Internet. Rotherhithe, just down the road from here, is one such example where because of history, the British Telecom cables are really poor, they are made of copper, they go to a big exchange point rather than the green boxes; it is really costly to change. Would it not be a great opportunity to use this money to fill some of these 'white spots' around London, some of them are outer London, to try to tackle that where the market has completely failed and there is no competition rather than this scheme which does not seem to be working particularly well?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I will take that back to the people who designed the scheme. My concern here, we need to ensure that different groups can access it.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** The people in Rotherhithe are a group and they do not have equal access to broadband and there are other areas as well; Redbridge and goodness knows where.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. There are some structural reasons as well. You can talk about the utilities sector and not being able to provide the infrastructure to do that but I can certainly take it back to the team. Jeff, I do not know if you have anything more.

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** No, nothing more.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** Perhaps you could write to us because there seems to be absolute inequality in terms of there are all sorts of pockets around London where people do not have equal access.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** It is just a point of information. I take Caroline's point but you will find the information in the work that the Economic Committee did and it is about this specific fund. Do not quote me but look at it because we did explore it. I do not think you can apply this fund for market failure which is basically what you are referring to, Caroline, and I take your point. These were issues that were raised, therefore, there has been a defeat and a discussion by the Economic Committee with the GLA officers around this. Answers can be found. Questions have been asked about this.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** OK. Shall we move on to some housing issues?

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Yes. These committees are working really well in flow because I raised this and we have had a conversation with the Mayor yesterday about homelessness, rough sleeping of young people. I suppose the question to your team and the equalities team, Munira, is really what monitoring you are doing and then feeding that back to the Mayor and to the GLA, therefore, they can get an understanding of what else they need to do. Is there a special issue as we hear from Shelter and from what I pick up in my constituency to do with young people? It is just an understanding about how you and your equalities' remit, what you do to feed in any challenge or monitoring. I am not clear about that.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. We have actually quite good data on the makeup of the rough sleeping numbers in London. Then if we look more broadly at homelessness because we know, for instance, the number of young people under the age of 18, it is very, very, small as rough sleepers; 18 to 25, it is about 12%. The Mayor's strategy to deal with this has supported a number of different programmes that target different groups and we also know that foreign nationals, for instance, increasingly form a very large proportion of rough sleepers.

I know through my work on the Migration Partnership Board as well that they tend to sleep together in groups as well which can create all sorts of other problems. All the time you have to look at the interventions that you are making and work out if they are appropriate to the new circumstances that are arising. I feel quite confident that the rough sleeping group, homelessness group that Richard Blakeway [Director of Housing] and my colleague chairs have considerable funds at his disposal that does meet together regularly and it does address the issues. That is monitored in the report.

Programmes like No Second Night Out are monitored quite regularly and reported back to the Mayor.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** OK, thanks. It is an ongoing issue, therefore, we will pick this up at another meeting, I am sure.

**Darren Johnson AM:** Yes. This was on the rise in households placed in outer borough temporary accommodation. We have seen a huge rise there; 270% increase on the 2010 level. Is this a concern and are you expecting this trend to continue?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Sorry, are we expecting the trend to continue? I do not know if I can answer that question. It is obviously very difficult to do this. We are primarily monitoring what has happened to date. It is obviously increasing. I cannot see a reason why it would stop in the next year.

**Darren Johnson AM:** The Mayor previously warned of the dangers of the costs of social cleansing and so on. Clearly it is a concern. I am just wondering what thinking there is to try to tackle this.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Obviously the major point about the issue of housing is to increase supply which has been one of the main commitments that the Mayor has made, therefore, it is a double number of house building, affordable housing and to increase at a rate which has not been seen for the last 20 years, the possibility of regenerating areas, building new housing developments, the mayoral opportunity areas; those are the ways in which the mayoralty are trying tackle that. In terms of actual support for families who find themselves without housing or who are presenting themselves, that is the statutory responsibility of the local authority and local authorities are taking up that work. That is not the statutory responsibility of the Mayor. His is primarily that increase of supply through the planning of houses and through land and working with developers.

**Darren Johnson AM:** But the Mayor is just seeing this primarily then as an issue around supply.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is about seeing his particular role. Obviously he talks to local authorities in the boroughs about the day-to-day issues of dealing with families who are presenting themselves as homeless but the statutory responsibility is with local authorities.

**Darren Johnson AM:** We know where the statutory responsibility is just in terms of statutory responsibilities around education and so on but in some areas, the Mayor is keen to take a leadership role, a co-ordinational role and so on that goes beyond the basic statutory responsibilities.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. His priority, where he feels he can do the most, is to increase the supply of housing. On that front, he has set quite challenging targets and is on track to deliver those. That is the way in which he feels he can make the most contribution to this issue.

**Darren Johnson AM:** But he does not see that there is potentially more of a role for him around homelessness that he could at least be playing a co-ordinational role across the boroughs. The evidence we get on the Housing Committee is that it often is disjointed from one borough to the next and can be quite patchy in terms of service provision and so on from borough to borough.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** In the area of rough sleeping, yes. In the area of rough sleeping, he has clearly convened a group; he chairs it, to look at rough sleeping. The area of housing supply.

**Darren Johnson AM:** Yes but beyond rough sleeping in terms of the wider issue of homelessness and temporary accommodation, again do you see that there is any specific leadership role for the Mayor there in the way that he has intervened on rough sleeping?

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** I think we have said we had this conversation last year. There are some things, as Munira said, where the Mayor has decided he can take the sort of role that you suggested. Others on this particular issue, where the statutory responsibility is very clear, insofar as there is a case or working across some boroughs, across all boroughs, then there is an obvious role for London Councils.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** There are certain other things like the London Rental Standard which are about trying to address the provision that is available for families but they are London-wide strategic initiatives. Other things like trying to encourage people, if they wish to relocate, so that they get houses which can only be used by younger families; those are things which have a London-wide approach. It is fairly understood amongst the different stakeholders that the local authorities do have a statutory responsibility and if the Mayor is to be involved, it just seems duplication and probably unhelpful to start trying to replicate. That is why I am reluctant to say, "Yes, he is going to do more in this area" because I do not think that is appropriate. He has made his position clear about his priorities.

**Andrew Boff AM:** When will the Hate Crime Strategy for London be published and how will the Mayor and MOPAC take forward that Strategy?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is going to be launched in the next few weeks.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Within the next few weeks?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes.

**Andrew Boff AM:** That is a great answer.

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** Is that before Christmas?

**Andrew Boff AM:** Yes, before Christmas? That is a good answer.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I cannot say more than that.

**Andrew Boff AM:** OK. We can measure it in weeks rather than months?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I can ask the team to tell me.

**Andrew Boff AM:** OK. And how are the Mayor and MOPAC going to take forward the Strategy? They can publish this Strategy but what are they then going to do to establish benchmarks and measure the performance?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** That will be contained in the Strategy.

**Andrew Boff AM:** It will be contained in it?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. Their objectives will be integrated with our annual equalities and so we will be able to refer back because MOPAC is included in the annual report. I know



that the Deputy Mayor [for Policing and Crime], Stephen Greenhalgh, has taken this issue quite seriously and has made it a priority for him. He wants more detailed targets and data about what the issues are and what the reporting rate is on different kinds of intervention. The report they are producing is basically quite centred on crime prevention and I know that he has met with various groups personally about that.

**Andrew Boff AM:** I am interested to know what the Mayor is doing to encourage the reporting of hate crime. If we can put it in context, I note the Mayor's Equality Report under the hate crime section - may I say first of all that there are good signs in this, I say that we only concentrate on the bad stuff but there are good signs and more people from different groups are reporting crimes against them. We know that is happening and it is a good thing.

However, there is one big absence in here: it does not even mention disability hate crime. A report published by Victoria Borwick [AM] a couple of months back indicates the massive under-reporting that there is from disabled people about hate crimes against them.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Sorry, it is mentioned in the report.

**Andrew Boff AM:** I beg your pardon. It mentions disability hate crime?

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Yes.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Page 24.

**Andrew Boff AM:** I was looking at the section from the Mayor's Office for Policing and Crime, hate crime on page 72.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** No, it is --

**Andrew Boff AM:** Where is that reference to disabilities?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is on the sanction detection rates.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Yes, disability hate crime, 13%, and it has whole numbers from 107 to 121.

**Andrew Boff AM:** What page is that on? Can you help me with which page number that is?

**Katie Smith (Head of Scrutiny & Investigations):** Sorry, that is actually taken from MOPAC's draft consultation on its hate crime --

**Andrew Boff AM:** Its draft consultation?

**Katie Smith (Head of Scrutiny & Investigations):** Yes, but --

**Andrew Boff AM:** This section is about the Equalities Report, and it is not in there.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I had not seen that it was missing, but I am sure it must be an error rather than deliberate exclusion because it is very much part of the policy.

**Andrew Boff AM:** I agree and much attention has been recently paid to disability hate crime, but I do not see it. I can see other groups in that hate crime section in the Equality Report, about measuring sanction detection

rates for homophobic, race and hate crimes, but I cannot see anything about disability. One of the problems is - and I would ask, perhaps, if you have not seen already the *Hidden Hate* report published by my colleague Victoria Borwick [AM] - the police have some of the lowest satisfaction rates amongst disabled people in terms of reporting crimes against them. It really is a shockingly awful record with regard to crimes and I would hope that we can see a reference to that in the Equalities Report next year.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is in the equality objectives that were revised earlier this year and so I do not understand why it would not be in this bit because we know that they do monitor that. In the stakeholder groups that we run, this has been a discussion and I know that there is still dissatisfaction with the way it is handled. I will come back to you on that and I will speak to MOPAC.

**Andrew Boff AM:** That report that we published had many recommendations, one of which was for the Metropolitan Police Service to automatically consider an attack against a disabled person as being a hate crime and to be recorded as a hate crime. I wonder if that is something that you can take back and consider because that actually would give us the kinds of stats that we need to be able to treat this problem serious. So many disabled people do not report those crimes against them because they have no confidence that they are going to be progressed.

With regard to MOPAC, what does MOPAC do to ensure that there is adequate support for lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) victims and for disabled victims of crime and do you think the needs of those categories of victim are being dealt with at the moment sufficiently?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Let us take the LGBT victims of hate crime first. There has been a policy to ensure that every borough has an LGBT liaison officer and every borough now has that. In four boroughs, they have a fulltime dedicated officer, in those boroughs where it is particularly a problem, and so there are resources and capacity built in to ensure that the police are able to deal with those victims and that they are able to deal with them sensitively.

That is not the case for victims of disability crime and I can take that concern about whether there should be. Again, it would be a capacity issue and it would be about the proportion and the number and what they can take.

I know that we have quite an active engagement with the LGBT and disability stakeholder groups that we meet at City Hall and we know that we facilitate their conversations with MOPAC to an extent and they have direct relationships as well. Therefore, that is an area that, as I said, the Deputy Mayor for Policing has seen as a priority. He recognises that it is part of the broader issue of satisfaction with the MPS and the community engagement and the feeling that they are being served properly. That is one of his assessment criteria overall about how well the MPS is going.

There are a number of different types of training and support that the police are doing to try to deal with those crimes because it is recognised that in the past they have not been so effective at dealing with them and encouraging report.

**Andrew Boff AM:** You alluded to the fact that each borough has an LGBT liaison officer, which is a welcome move. However, they can be variable. Some are fulltime. Some are part-time. Some seem to be allocated on the basis of, "Who wants to do this job? You because you put your hand up". Are we confident that there is a consistent level of service to the LGBT community from those officers throughout London?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** They are trained. They are given support to play that role. The boroughs where they have fulltime dedicated officers are in areas where there is a high

incidence of that kind of crime, the places you might expect: Westminster, Lambeth, Kensington and Chelsea and Tower Hamlets. Those are areas where the Borough Commanders have decided that actually they need someone fulltime to deal with it. It is not a random selection of boroughs. Let us put it that way. Obviously, there is a network of people who get training and who work with each other and support each other as well.

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** This has also been discussed quite extensively at the LGBT stakeholder group, which meets twice yearly.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I talked to them about this and they recognise that there are capacity issues but they are quite keen to work with the MPS on how they do it or MOPAC. I have been involved in those discussions.

**Andrew Boff AM:** Thank you very much.

**John Biggs AM:** I am interested in the question of support and I have represented people for quite a long time now. I find that people who can be vulnerable in some particular way, whether they are isolated or whether they are in some way separate for a reason such as their physical ability or whether they are being discriminated against because of their sexuality. This relates to the earlier question that Andrew was asking about people not reporting because they do not feel they will be supported.

Do you feel enough work is being done to understand what it is that people would like to see happen that is not happening? Having a liaison officer is one thing and the officer can go and meet groups of people and talk about the particular concerns of the wider community. However, in terms of support for a disabled person who has suffered abuse from a neighbour or something, the sorts of things that they will need will be materially different from those of many other people who are able to nip out down the road and deal with this and who are less isolated by it. Do you think that as a service provider we understand enough about that? We have a Strategy and we tick boxes, but are we doing enough about it?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** That is why there is a Hate Crime Strategy being developed: because it is recognised --

**John Biggs AM:** Yes, but it is still a long way back in development. Sorry, that was not a grammatically correct sentence or even a sentence at all. It is still in development?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is, but it will be out soon. That is why it is being developed.

**John Biggs AM:** All right. I made the fundamental error of leaving the room while you were saying that. OK.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** There is a Hate Crime Strategy, which will be published in a few weeks. It is looking at this whole area because it is recognised that previously the police were not dealing with these crimes in the way that --

**John Biggs AM:** Do you accept this? Politicians are always vain and so I was struck by my question to Mr Hendy about changing the culture of TfL. I think we all recognise that to do these things we need to change the culture of organisations. Are you clear about that as well?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. That is why I think Stephen Greenhalgh [Deputy Mayor for Policing and Crime] has made it a priority: because he has recognised that this is just one aspect of the way in which it is seen that the police have not in the past been so effective at dealing with

issues that arise. Particularly in London, we know that there are tensions between groups and in certain areas it has led to a very high number of incidents.

Does there need to be a culture change? The intention is that there has to be a culture change in many different ways. That is the process that is being developed. It is about training with people recognising that the public is not one undifferentiated mass and that there are some sensitivities and that some groups that are worth engaging with. We are refreshing the stakeholder groups that the MPS have been dealing with and working with us on making sure that other groups are included. We have quite regular conversations with stakeholder groups and they are very open at being critical of the MPS when they want to be. I think they feel that they can be. In the development of the Strategy, certainly from what I can tell from the conversations I have had, people are satisfied that they have been consulted as part of it. There was a very long consultation and Stephen [Greenhalgh] personally went and met lots of these groups. The feedback that I have had is that he was very open and listened. We will see when the Strategy is launched and the reception that it gets, but that is one of the ways in which people are trying to drive cultural change.

There are some other issues about the recruitment at the MPS and whether the people who are taking these positions are aware and understand the communities in which they serve and that is why making sure that there is a diversity of people who are working in police forces has obviously been a pressing political issue. The Mayor has already said that.

**John Biggs AM:** OK. Thank you, Chair.

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** We are very successful in dealing with improvements as far as education is concerned amongst the different groups in London, but there are two signal failures, which are white boys and black boys. Can I know precisely how you are seeking to address that?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** The Mayor has an education and youth programme and we deliver a number of interventions and, again, this is discretionary, not statutory --

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** Indeed.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** -- youth services, but it is funding that we have secured from within the GLA and externally we work very much in partnership with other agencies as well.

On the education side particularly to do with attainment, we have done a huge amount of work through our London Schools Excellence Fund to work with teachers on narrowing the gap and on areas like literacy and numeracy. We know that those two groups that you mentioned have disproportionately lower attainment in those areas and that those are regarded as 'gateway subjects' into the curriculum and later attainment. We know that those are priority areas and that is reflected in the funding that we have been giving out. Through our Gold Club programme with London schools, there are seminars specifically dedicated to how to deal with either particular groups or particular problems in cohorts within schools.

There are efforts being made in terms of school improvement generally to try to deal with those two groups. They are not always branded as education programmes to deal with white working-class boys. They are about school improvement generally, but it is understood that as part of that work we will be addressing these particular cohorts.

We have a youth programme as well, which is supporting activity outside of school, whether it is through sport, culture or music or whether it is after-school clubs, educational work that does not take place in a formal school setting, which also works with children and young people who are particularly disadvantaged and

particularly at risk of being excluded. For example, the leadership club programme, which works with over 1,000 children in about 20 different schools, is working with a high number of children who would fall into the two groups that you mentioned. There are things that we are doing to try to address that.

Overall, school improvement has been remarkable in London in the last 15 years and it is recognised that the pace of improvement has been very rapid. The key thing is that the Mayor and the GLA plays a facilitating role for the profession and for schools to try to do the research and try to understand what works and how to address some of these problems, which have been consistent issues for the last ten years. However, for lots of groups there have been quite considerable strides in improvement and it shows that there does not need to be an inevitable disparity or gap between --

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** You say that, Munira, but is it not a fact that right from the very beginning when they have broken educational attainment down into these categories, white poor boys have always been at the bottom, even from the very beginning, irrespective of how recently the latest ethnic group may have come in? Poor white boys have always underperformed.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes, but everyone's attainment has actually gone up. The gap remains, but the overall attainment has improved for a lot of groups.

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** Are you saying that on the basis that a rising tide lifts all boats?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes, I may have used that phrase before. That is true.

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** Is it?

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** What if you are drowning?

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** I do not want to extend the metaphor too much. Is the attainment of poor white boys actually improving?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is improving but, remember, it is improving in absolute terms. In relative terms, there remains a stubborn gap. However, the improvement is consistent across all groups. What we would argue is that over time, as school improvement gets more mature and schools start learning from each other, they will have the tools and the capacity to address some of what might be regarded as intractable problems. They will start to deal with some of these problems.

The other thing is to recognise that the data and the way that data is measured across London and across the country by ethnic group is sometimes not granular enough. Actually, what is defined as 'black boys' in London hides an incredibly diversity of different nationalities and different immigrant groups, some of whom have been in London for a long time, some of whom have arrived very recently. The experience of Nigerian boys is very different to Somali boys, yet they are all classed as the same ethnic group. I would just caution against using these labels and saying that they are intractable and nothing can be done. Actually, within these groups there is considerable variation as well.

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** I see that. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Just adding on from Tony's discussion, we had a really good lunchtime briefing from the Office for National Statistics (ONS) yesterday picking up this very point about, if you like, questioning the use of the terms 'black' and 'white' when dealing with data. For instance, Turkish people could tick the

‘white/European’ box but their needs are specific. When you look at that community, you find huge challenges regarding education for, say, the Kurdish community because they speak Kurdish when people assume they should be speaking Turkish and there are all sorts of complications. Therefore, I take your point about that granularity.

However, to deal with that granularity, do you not have to have a commitment to be more focused about the challenges you make and to be asking questions about how Somali boys are doing or how east London white bots are doing? Do you not have to do that? It just seems to me that that is an area that you would be shy in getting involved in. I may be wrong.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Sorry, I am shy? We are publishing the Annual Education Report tomorrow which contains lots of data about how schools are doing with different groups and progress and so on. We do have that data and the DfE has that data.

Obviously, our priorities are about how we intervene and try to make improvements. The thing we have heard resoundingly from a lot of London schools is that actually by improving the quality of teaching in subject areas, you will raise the level of all these groups and you will start to narrow the gaps. For instance, Kevan Collins, who was the Director of Children’s Services in Tower Hamlets and the Chief Executive in Tower Hamlets, now is the Chief Executive of the Education Endowment Fund, which is a body that supports educational research and looks into what works and looks into how education most helps those disadvantaged children. His argument was that programmes that were directed at specific ethnic groups and which were tailored towards those ethnic groups were less successful than programmes that were about just raising the level of educational achievement for whole schools.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** That is based on his Tower Hamlets experience?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is and Tower Hamlets is obviously a very good example where educational attainment was improved. That has been a consistent message from most school leaders in London. I am sure there will be people who disagree with it but we cannot ignore that view. It is right to know what the data is telling us and to look for any patterns or anything that would be of concern, but a lot of the variation we can explain and understand. The nature of our interventions and other agencies’ interventions and what informs that is a belief that by tackling some of the structural issues to do with teaching quality, teaching workforce and leadership, all those things will start to address these problems.

I am sorry. I am not sure if I am answering your question as well as you want, but I am conscious --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** No, you are because it is one way of looking at it.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. We are concerned about any group that looks like it is not doing as well as it ought to and is not keeping up with other groups. How we deal with that and how we address that might be by improving education for whole schools rather than just thinking that it will be targeted at just one group.

Can I just make one addition to that, which sounds like it is a contradiction but it is not: we have been funding a series of projects which are about improving the teaching for students with English as a second language --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Of course.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** -- because we do know that they have a particular need, which again is across different ethnic groups. It tends to be more about recent migrants and

parents with difficulties speaking English. We received match funding from the European Integration Fund for that programme. It is over £1 million and we are working with a number of different schools that have expertise in that area. In fact, Kevan Collins [Chief Executive, Education Endowment Foundation], whom I just mentioned, has helped to advise on the shape of that programme. We are doing things which are tackling particular problems when it comes to teaching new migrant groups, which is an issue in London. However, it is not divided according to ethnicity, actually, because it tends to cut across different ethnic groups.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Targeting, or whatever you want to call it, yes. That is useful. That takes me on to the next question about a particular group and if I can just say to you let us look at young people from Gypsy, Roma and Traveller heritage and their educational attainment. We know from the Mayor's Education Inquiry in 2012, from the Mayor of London's Annual Education Report 2013 and from the Mayor's Education Inquiry, again in October 2012, that this is a group that there are concerns about. They are more likely to be absent from school. They are performing particularly poorly. They are disproportionately excluded from school. That comes out of the Mayor's own documents and the Mayor's own commission. Can you tell us how you have actually dealt with those particular issues regarding this identified group?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I will have to be honest. There are certain groups where because of the strategic nature of our work, we have not been able to do as much as I would like to deal with those groups. That is a good example of a group where with the purely limited capacity and limited resource that we have, we have not directly funded or supported projects for that particular group.

However, you are right that it is an issue and it affects certain boroughs particularly. In Hillingdon, for instance, and Waltham Forest, those are boroughs where they have concentrated and schools have particular problems there. In some of those boroughs, we have Gold Club schools and we are funding Excellence Fund projects. There is data that we can collect from projects that have those ethnic groups present in the cohort they are dealing with. There are other groups like looked-after children where I would like us to be able to do more but --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** If we stay with the children from Gypsy, Roma and Traveller heritage, there is another issue with this group. Whereas girls outperform boys in a number of subject areas, do we know whether girls from Gypsy, Roma and Traveller heritage share this commonality or are they subject to an extra penalty because maybe this community is - I do not know - less gender-aware?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I do not know. I will have to come back to you on the data. I do not know if we have the data. I presume we must have the data breakdown within that ethnic group because we do have it for others as well, but I can come back to you on that.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Again, this would be a group of young women who are out with their peer group in this capital city because they are Londoners and so that is something that we could ask a question about: whether they conform to girls' attainment generally or whether there is an extra factor that is impacting on them because of the community and their heritage.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** One of your officers might be able to ask to come in here with your permission, if that is OK.

**Sue Johnson (Senior Diversity and Social Policy Officer):** Unfortunately, one of the unfortunate things about the data we were provided with is when I first joined the GLA, we did get the data broken down by gender and ethnicity, but that data is no longer provided and has not been provided for a number of years. It is not a question that we have asked, because the data is missing and not available to us.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** We cannot break down within ethnic groups.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** What did you say? You would love to have it but you have not?

**Sue Johnson (Senior Diversity and Social Policy Officer):** We would love to have it but have not been provided with it but we have not --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Provided by whom, sorry? Can I ask?

**Sue Johnson (Senior Diversity and Social Policy Officer):** By the DfE.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** OK.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** We might wish to follow that up outside.

**John Biggs AM:** I know there has been quite an - I think - effective initiative that looks after children in terms of having a virtual parallel education system and we have a virtual head teacher, or whatever. That is clearly an initiative which is addressing a particularly disadvantaged group that tends to chronically underperform. I just venturing that were anyone at City Hall to take a more active interest in the Traveller community - and I hope I am not putting it too negatively in saying that - they might want to look at whether there are other initiatives which might parallel the Traveller community in terms of mentoring stronger educational performance.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. We have done some work on looked-after children. We had a peer mentoring scheme which was about encouraging them with homework clubs, mentoring and so on. Through the Excellence Fund, we have supported a few things. Obviously, we talk to the virtual school heads and other agencies. The reality is that there are lots of things that we would like to do and there are actually other groups and there are other cohorts within London who are outliers in the statistics that we could focus on. It is really a matter for the politicians.

**John Biggs AM:** The purpose of the Equality Strategy is to identify the areas where we are not reaching and not performing and identifying areas for prioritisation. Obviously, we do not have the resources to prioritise and then we might say, "Sorry, we do not have the resources", but we should in a very open and transparent way identify what those failings are.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes. I suppose a comment on priorities and resourcing, which is that what we have to do as the GLA with the limited resources that we have and because we are not a statutory funder for education, we have to think about where we can add the most value in the most efficient way and where we can encourage and support federations of schools and borough organisations. There are still children's services within boroughs. Where does it make sense for them to tackle issues which are more localised and about particular communities and where is it appropriate for us? That is the constant discussion we have.

**John Biggs AM:** I have been in meetings since 7.00 am this morning it feels like, but this is a very important issue for me and hopefully to all other Assembly Members. Clearly, it is an area where there are all sorts of prejudices and boundary issues and City Hall has made a very active decision to keep out of the way of the boroughs on this issue. It seems to me that if we have an Equalities Strategy which is committed to the principles of equalities, it should desist from withdrawing from that issue. This is the problem. It might then say, "Sorry, this is too hot to handle. We are going to let the boroughs neglect their duty as they always have done", and then that will follow out of it, but we need to identify what the problem is.



**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** We are not withdrawing in the sense that we are saying we do not care. That is why we publish an Annual Education Report. We want --

**John Biggs AM:** No, it is the boroughs that do not care. Let us be clear about that.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Sorry, the boroughs who do? I do not --

**John Biggs AM:** Quite a lot of the boroughs do not care.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** That is why we publish an Annual Education Report: so that we can make clear how attainment is in London schools. We just have to recognise that the things we can actively do and the programmes that we can actively fund will always be limited if they --

**John Biggs AM:** Yes, I know.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** I think what John Biggs is trying to say is we recognise that, but equally this document is about identifying issues and problems --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** The specifics.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** -- and not that you have to deal with them, but others may deal with them.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Others may deal with them.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** It is that championing role that I think people were looking for in this document.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** It has never been there.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** What I am hearing --

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** There is a couple of other areas. I do not think you are disagreeing or that we are trying to say, "You have to do this work", but it is highlighting these topics and saying, all right, this is an issue but it is not for us to do, maybe, whether it is because we are statutory or because we do not have the resources to do it.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** What I am hearing is that you would like us in our monitoring and in our Equalities Report to identify in more granular detail about the education and attainment of different groups?

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** The challenge.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** You would like us to identify particular groups that may be having problems.

**John Biggs AM:** For the older ones here, if we recast our minds back, there was a time when people said, "It does not matter. It all comes out in the wash. People will look after themselves". Then we had the equalities legislation on race discrimination and gender discrimination and disabilities and so on.

It seems to me that one of the most vulnerable and disadvantaged and excluded groups, which does not exactly cross the road to make friends for itself on occasions, is the Traveller community. There are chronic issues of under-attainment. We talk about education in this instance. If we have an equalities duty, we should be looking at that. We may say it is too hot to handle or it is too difficult to solve, but we should be nakedly looking at this problem and identifying that it is a problem and then working out what we do next.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** OK. It should be quite straightforward for us to be able to look at which particular groups and which particular issues we might want to highlight in this report.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** The point was made about resources and it can come back to me, but I would have thought - and I am sure I have raised this with Amanda [Coyle] or perhaps it is in my mind - that I cannot accept that the Gypsy, Roma and Traveller communities do not fit into the European Social Fund (ESF) spend in terms of education and stuff like that. In the same way that you can award blocks of money to a particular group, I do not understand why you have not done that except to say it was a decision that was made not to.

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** The rules surrounding ESF actually are predicated on the fact that the young people need to be NEET and often actually getting that information from those groups is difficult.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** It is difficult, but I thought difficult is what you do, Amanda, before you have breakfast.

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** I try to.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** It is possible to identify. For instance, some of our programmes do target black and minority ethnic groups and so they are broader. They have tended to be, just because they are large, strategic funds and the nature of the contract means that they have to be quite broad in the cohort. We have not tended to focus on individual ethnic groups. It would become quite unwieldy to try to have that many small contracts because they would inevitably be smaller if you were going to focus on individual ethnic groups like that.

There may be other ways. What I am hearing loud and clear is that the report could identify those particular groups and then identify other ways or other partners who may be able to do that particular work.

**John Biggs AM:** To be fair to my colleagues, you are hearing it from only two of us or maybe three of us or four of us but --

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** I do not think that is because people do not think it is an important issue, but --

**John Biggs AM:** They are scarred by experience.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** No, I think we are right to because I can identify Members who would not touch this area with a bargepole, but I will say no more and I will move on. [Gestures towards Tony Arbour AM.] (He is to the right of me!)

**Darren Johnson AM:** He came to our Housing Committee session on Gypsies and Travellers the other week, in his defence.

**Tony Arbour AM (Deputy Chair):** Yes, I did.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Can I say he can only be improving with exposure? We can only hope.

Can I just go on to education funding? I would be surprised if you did not know about the discussions that took place yesterday in the Chamber about this leaked report, which I am assuming comes out of your area, about the spend in this area. Let me just fast-forward and say that at the end of all this, the Mayor gave me a commitment that he would not be looking at a proposal that reduced the funding of this area by £2 million by 2016/17. I do not have the paper in front of me. He has made that commitment in public.

Given that many of the projects in this area are time-limited, can you confirm whether you have bids in or who you are talking to to actually take some of this valuable work on? It would just be so totally unacceptable and it is nothing to do with a mayoral term. It is about doing good work that is benefiting London's young people. That is the issue for me.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** To provide context, obviously in 2008 when the Mayor began, there was a relatively low amount of funding that went into the area of education that was discretionary funding. It was fairly low. Then, over the years and when I started taking over this brief, we increased the amount of funding and brought in additional funding from the DfE and other partners. The point that has been made is that it is not an active decision to cut programmes. It is the natural end of funding that we have received from external sources and internally for programmes that were always intended to be time-limited and were advertised as such. It is a slightly strange position where you are being punished for having increased funding for a number of years to try to create programmes and then it was always expected that these programmes would end.

In terms of future work in this area, we would all agree and the Mayor has agreed that we want to continue our work in this area. We are going through a budget process now. We are having discussions about what the nature of that work is and what it would look like. Those will be published along with everything else. However, it is not a premature cut to something that was ongoing. These are programmes that were always meant to be two to three years --

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** In fact, I totally understand what you are saying and, to take you back to start of this, one key critique about mayoral involvement in this area was that it would not be satisfactory to just see it along mayoral timelines in terms of a term. We have moved on from the point of how when they started there was no funding there. Each Mayor can choose to get involved in any area that impacts on the lives and the quality of life of Londoners. In terms of equality, we are the only legislative body that has a requirement to actually ensure equality in terms of the work that the Mayor does. Whether it is statutory or whether it is a whim of his, he has to meet that requirement.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Could I just make one point? This is a general point. It is not related to a particular pot of funding or particularly just education and youth. I do think there is a role for the GLA to use funding and to make interventions which are catalysts. For every single project that we fund, we always ask our partner organisation, "Is there an exit strategy and what is the sustainability of this?" In the case of some partners, they have funds of their own. What we want to do is to prove a model and we want to prove that it works and that it is worth their while operating in that way so that they continue it. Therefore, I would just take issue with the idea that because we have spent money or given money to certain organisations or at a particular level, that that has to continue in the same way indefinitely because to do otherwise would be to fail young people. It is the opposite. It is that we are trying to stimulate activity as well.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Can I take you back to where this comes from and that is the Education Commission's work and recommendations? Some of this spend related to some of those recommendations.

All that I wanted to question was whether in your budgetary planning - and it may not be you; it may be Jeff [Jacobs] and whoever - are people thinking about how many of these key projects linked to issues of equality and linked to Londoners' wellbeing will continue after the funding has finished? I take your point about everybody knowing, but in knowing there is also contingency planning to actually carry on this practice. All I am seeking is some sort of insight into how this is going to be dealt with. Given yesterday's commitment by the Mayor, which may not have flowed through the system yet, I just wanted some assurance that we are not as an Assembly going to let this go.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** I am very passionate about this area, as you know, and I am very keen to see good work continuing.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** All right. Head of Paid Service, did you have anything to say?

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** Munira said what I was going to say.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** You are passionate about the subject?

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** I do not have to be passionate. I am just the Head of Paid Service. What Munira [Mirza] said is as much as we can say about it. There is a budget process going on. Some of what you said directly relates to what she said earlier. There is a need on some of these projects to absolutely fairly say they were time-limited or are time-limited and were always intended to end at a certain time. However, as you said, there are exit strategy requirements built into them and expectations about how we can learn. Some of the evaluations have not been completed and have not been done yet about these schemes. All of that had to be in the pot. What we should not be doing - and I did not hear you at all doing it - was to say that because the expenditure level has been at X, X is the figure that has to be continued, because X in this case was massively inflated by our ability to get external funding, which we do not know is on offer.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** Thank you, but it is also your job as well to pick up Mayoral commitments and to then turn them into reality, is it not?

**Jeff Jacobs (Head of Paid Service and Executive Director of Communities and Intelligence):** As much as I can.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** OK. I look forward to hear how you are going to do that one, then.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** To be fair to Members, we are only based on what is in that officer document. Exit strategies and the curtailment of funding was not a high prioritisation. If we accept that, there is a debate to be had now around this table on both your Mayoral side as well as the Assembly side. We know there are difficult times, but how do we keep going? There may well be new needs. I take the very point you said about catalyst funding and where that is, but people need to be clearer from the very beginning that that is what is on offer and, equally, in terms of the narrative that we are dealing with. Let us carry on, but there is a debate to be had and it will be very interesting following from the publication of some of your educational issues and some new areas or the continuation of other areas and what you are thinking. That needs to be included in the debate.

**Jennette Arnold OBE AM:** It is something that the Education Panel can pick up, Chair.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** Yes. All right.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** I have a completely different issue. Overall, I have to say I am disappointed with the report. There is too much that is marked as green and amber which probably ought to be red. For example, on the child poverty rate, we are the lowest in the country and it has plateaued for several years, yet it is only on amber. That should be a red. It is the same with the number of apprenticeships and so on. I just want to flag that you need to look at your traffic-lighting because I do not think it gives an accurate reflection.

Secondly, on the issue of debt, I have asked some Mayor's Questions and my colleague has. Debt and related issues come under you, Munira. It is an issue in terms of equalities and we are told it comes under your equalities portfolio. It is not addressed at all in here. Where is the data? What are you monitoring? What are you trying to do in this field? Or should it perhaps sit with someone else if you have such a broad remit?

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** We did have a Debt Strategy Group, which was --

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** Yes, which has not met for a long time.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** -- convened by the GLA and it was decided not to continue it because Toynbee Hall was doing quite a lot of work. We offered numerous ways and we have a relationship with them to support them where it is appropriate.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** I am not sure it is that good. I met them last week and it sounded like you are using Toynbee Hall, or the Mayor is, and actually it is not really that close.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** If you want to come back to me on particular things you think we should do? We have said to them that if there are things they think we should be doing, we will talk to them about that.

On the traffic light issue, it is an assessment about how things are going. It is amber because it was recognised that there is a problem with childcare costs, but there is also a drive to try to do certain things about that and to increase the nature of the provision and the supply of the provision. It is always right to point out to us if you think that we are not being honest or critical enough of ourselves. I take that point. If any Members want to look at the traffic lights and say, "Actually, we do not think that this is quite a fair assessment", I am very willing to look at that and take that on board.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** On debt, you have not answered at all. Is there just nothing going on in this area at City Hall? Amanda, do you know anything else?

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** Yes. We are aware that you produced a report on debt and my team has been working with the Economic and Business Unit team to prepare a response for that. I understand that is certainly coming in the next couple of weeks, but we can get back to you and give you the exact date in terms of the piece of work we have been doing to respond to your report. Within there, it actually points out what is the position in London and what particular action needs to be taken.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** And what actions you are taking?

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** And what particular pieces of action are being proposed.

**Caroline Pidgeon MBE AM:** OK.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** I am just being advised that the Economy Committee is doing an investigation into debt and we should pick up some of that work as well.

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** Yes, we have received some questions about that and that is the report I am referring to.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** I just have some final points. We have come a long way in this report and it is in a better shape than where it was, but there are still some gaps. I am just going to take a couple more issues. I do not want to take too much time on this.

On the environment, we talk about RE:NEW and we talk about affordability of bills, but we do not really talk about fuel poverty. If nationally 3,000 people are dying, as a proportion of that there is a substantial number who are going to be dying in London around that. There are some issues of highlighting that. Also, looking at RE:NEW, is it not time? I think your own point was about refreshing and reviving it because we are going to miss the target again on RE:NEW. There are some issues around trends. Somehow with some of these areas when we see them in the documents, we carry on and we are not asking the right questions in the sense of saying, "Where do we go with these programmes?" There are some issues there and I take that on that bit.

Then I look at the health stuff. The Darzi [London Health] Commission points to issues in terms of the blunt inequalities of health and premature death and life chances. We need to refresh and revive this. Again, it is one of those areas where the Mayor is not statutorily in control, but in terms of a London issue of pointing directives for others to follow and his contribution to that, we just need to refresh and revive it for the next one that comes up. What we will do is we will consult further with the Group and we will maybe offer some suggestions for the future of it. This is a work in progress, but as a tool and a document, we are in a better place than we were in previous years. There are some issues that are slightly missing which we just covered and there are some issues that need greater definition. We ought to come back and try to give you that in a written narrative so that we can just move on. Certainly on health, you could just re-look at that bit again because you could do more.

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** Yes, OK.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** We can challenge us all, really, on some of the issues and the killers and where we should be saying and use that as part of the advocacy for change, really.

**Amanda Coyle (Assistant Director, Health & Communities):** Yes, that would be really helpful in terms of thinking about our response to the commission and some of the actions we want to take.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Do you mind if I make just one final point about the breadth of this report and how it has grown, actually, since 2008? You will have to forgive me because I feel that sometimes you are asking me questions about huge areas of policy and I just cannot possibly be abreast of all the detail of them. The reason for that is what I understand about them is the equalities dimension. What is happening is that the issue of the cost of living is becoming the thrust behind a lot of these questions and I do recognise that the framework that was set out originally in the legislation about the public sector equality duty is trying to contain actually a much broader set of political issues and questions. It has been a very useful discussion because I need to go back to my colleagues in the rest of the mayoral team to look at how we can respond better to some of these questions as well and make sure the data we are collecting is dealing with that. I am not suggesting that the report in its current format deals with all of those questions as well as it could. I just think we need to reflect on this whole area of the cost of living because,

actually, it does affect groups disproportionately, which is a factor, but it does not just affect those groups. It affects everybody. Thank you for your questions.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** You are right. Indeed, there are the political stances that are taken in this report, but there are also institutional because this will carry on. Even on institutional, how do we use this document and how do others use this document in terms of shaping their policies or taking further action that we can monitor them on? That is just as important. We tend to look at what we can do, but actually we should be seeking to influence others as well.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** Yes, and that is a large thrust of how the GLA works, actually. It has to.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** I suppose the test for us around scrutiny is maybe - and I will just pick this area - that we end up inviting in London Health and saying, "Where are you on the equalities issues and how far have you got? Can you track it and show it to us?" That is something about our scrutiny issues in future years we need to think about in terms of this document.

**Munira Mirza (Deputy Mayor for Education & Culture):** There are two levels of scrutiny. There is our scrutiny because we do have to scrutinise ourselves as the Mayor's Office as appropriate. However, there is obviously the way in which you scrutinise.

**Len Duvall AM (Chair):** In that spirit, we will further review some of our comments and put those in writing to you as well. Thank you for the way that you have answered questions and we are sorry that we have over-run and detained you. We started by over-running and I think it has been useful on both sides. Thank you very much.